

Galway County Council
Comhairle Chontae Na Gaillimhe



Comhairle Chontae na Gaillimhe
Galway County Council.

Quality Assurance Report for 2018

Galway County Council

To Be Submitted to the National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC), In Compliance with the Public Spending Code

Certification

This Annual Quality Assurance Report reflects Galway County Councils assessment of compliance with the Public Spending Code. It is based on the best financial, organisational and performance related information available across the various areas of responsibility.

Signature of Accounting Officer:



Mr. Kevin Kelly
Chief Executive

Date: 28th May 2019

1	Introduction	3
1.1	Quality Assurance Reporting	4
1.2	The Quality Assurance Process contains the following five steps:	4
2	Expenditure Analysis	6
1.3	Inventory of Projects/Programmes.....	6
1.4	Summary of Inventory Analysis	7
1.5	Published Summary of Procurements	9
3	Assessment of Compliance	10
1.6	Checklist Completion	10
1.7	Procedure used	10
1.8	Checklist Results.....	11
1.9	Main Issues Arising from Checklist Assessment	11
1.10	In-Depth Checks	12
4	Internal Audit	13
1.11	Summary of the Internal Audit in-depth check carried out on the N6 Galway City Bypass Appraisal Stage.....	13
1.12	Project Description.....	13
1.13	Appraisal stage.....	14
1.14	Summary of In-Depth Check- Revenue Expenditure	15
1.15	Recommendations for future year QA reports.....	24
5	Conclusion.....	25
	Appendix 1A - Summary Inventory of Projects and Programmes > €0.5m	26
	Appendix 1B - Full Inventory Listing.....	27
	Appendix 2 - Reports Arising from In-Depth Checks- Checklists 1-7	32
	Appendix 3 – Internal Audit In-depth Checks	47

1 Introduction

Galway County Council (GCC) has completed this Quality Assurance (QA) Report as part of its on-going compliance with the Public Spending Code (PSC).

GCC have again fully noted the last changes made to the QA Report which were introduced in 2016. A guidance note for the Local Government Sector issued Feb 2017. A summary of the primary changes for 2017 to 2019 are:

Agreement on the submission date – now formally agreed as 31st May.

Agreement that any future amendments to the Guidance for the Local Government sector will be channelled through the CCMA Finance Committee.

Inclusion of Methodology and Template for In-depth Review. (Appendix in Report)

Agreed revisions in Checklists – with relevant notes.

Change in approach for determining projects for in-depth review.

Redefinition of Capital Grant Schemes for the purpose of the QA exercise.

Addition of Notes Column to Project Inventory

The information provided is based on responses from “Project Owners” who are integral to both the application of the PSC & the filing of this Report. Project Owners were asked to confirm / verify the contents of the Inventory listing.

1.1 Quality Assurance Reporting

The Public Spending Code requires public bodies to establish an internal, independent, quality assurance procedure involving annual reporting on how organisations are meeting their Public Spending Code obligations. This new Quality Assurance procedure replaces and updates the “spot check” requirements previously laid down in Circular letter dated 15th May 2007. The Public Spending Code seeks to ensure that the state achieves value for money in the use of all public funds.

1.2 The Quality Assurance Process contains the following five steps:

1.2.1 Drawing up Inventories of all projects/programmes at different stages of the Project (expenditure) Life Cycle.

The four stages of the life cycle are:

1. Appraisal,
2. Planning / Design,
3. Implementation (Management)
4. Post –Project / Post Implementation Review

The inventory must include all current and capital Projects / Programmes whose expenditure is above €0.5m for the year under review. Each Project / Programme must be categorised under one of the following areas /stages of expenditure:

- | | |
|-------------------------------------|--|
| Expenditure being considered | - (Appraisal, Planning) |
| Expenditure being incurred | - (Management, Monitoring, Evaluation) |
| Expenditure that has recently ended | - (Review, Evaluation) |

1.2.2 Publishing summary information on website of all procurements in excess of €10m, whether new, in progress or completed in the year under review.

1.2.3 Completing checklists in respect of the different areas / stages of expenditure.

This self-assessed estimate of compliance can be based on an appropriate sample of the projects/areas of expenditure that are relevant to the checklist. The sample could be 5-10% of projects/programmes. The sample should rotate from year to year.

These are high level checks that should be readily completed within each organisation. Only one of each checklist per Organisation/Agency/Local Authority is required. Checklists are not required for each project/programme. The QA process for verifying the accuracy of responses on the checklist is based on a sample of projects/programmes and is Step 4 of the process.

1.2.4 Carrying out a more in-depth check on a small number of selected projects/programmes.

The value of the projects selected per annum, should be at least 5% of the total value of all projects in the inventory. This minimum is an average over a three year period.

1.2.5 Completing a short report for the National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC).

The report will be generated as a matter of course through compliance with steps 1-4 above. It includes:-

The inventory of all projects/programmes above €0.5m

The website reference for the publication of procurements above €10m

The completed checklists

The Organisation's judgement on the adequacy of processes given the findings from the in-depth checks and

The Organisation's proposals to remedy any discovered inadequacies.

2 Expenditure Analysis

1.3 Inventory of Projects/Programmes

This section details the inventory drawn up by GCC in accordance with the guidance on the Quality Assurance process. The inventory lists all of GCCs projects and programmes at various stages of the project life cycle for 2018 whose expenditure was above €0.5m. It is noted that the Public Spending Code provides that expenditure increases by €0.5m or a new programme exceeding €0.5m shall be included. This inventory is divided between current and capital projects / programmes (further sub-divided between Capital Grant schemes & Capital Projects) which are ultimately categorised under one of the following relevant areas / stages of expenditure:

Expenditure being considered

Expenditure being incurred

Expenditure that has recently ended

For the Purposes of this Report:-

Capital Expenditure refers to Capital Projects/Programmes for 2018 whose lifetime cost (all costs that arise over the lifetime of a project) is estimated to exceed €0.5m.

Current Expenditure refers to revenue expenditure for services exceeding €0.5m in 2018 (base on services identified in the AFS for the year under review)

Tables 1, 2 and 3 below, list a summary per Service Division of Galway County Councils compiled inventory. Full tables including details of each project / programme are listed in Appendix 1. For the purposes of clarity and accuracy the inventory in appendix 1 was compiled using the suggested template that accompanied the Quality Assurance Requirements - Guidance note dated February 2018.

1.4 Summary of Inventory Analysis

1.4.1 Expenditure Being Considered

Table 1 provides a summary of the inventory of expenditures above €0.5m being considered by Galway County Council. As the table identifies (see below), there are 12 projects being considered across the various spending categories.

1.4.2 Expenditure Being Incurred

Table 2 provides a summary of the inventory of expenditures above €0.5m being incurred by Galway County Council. In total there are 82 projects or programmes which are currently incurring expenditure of over €0.5m. The split between capital and current expenditure projects and across the three value categories is 37 Capital Projects and 45 Current Expenditure Projects. The full breakdown and description of these projects is listed in Appendix 1.

1.4.3 Expenditure Recently Ended

Table 3 provides a summary of the inventory of expenditures above €0.5m recently ended by Galway County Council. There are 3 projects or programmes that have recently ended which incurred expenditure of over €0.5m. The full breakdown and description of these projects is listed in Appendix 1.

Tables 1-3

Table 1: No of Expenditure Projects "Being Considered" by Category

Service /Division	Current Expenditure			Capital Expenditure		
	A	B	C	A	B	C
Housing Programme				6	3	
Roads Programme				2		1
Water Services Programme						
Planning & Development						
Environmental Services Programme						
Recreation & Amenity						
Agriculture, Education, Health & Welfare						
Miscellaneous Services						
Total:	0		0	8	3	1

A: €0.5-€5m, B: €5m-€20m, C: > €20m

Table 2: No of Expenditure Projects "Being Incurred" by Category

Service /Division	Current Expenditure			Capital Expenditure		
	A	B	C	A	B	C
Housing Programme	7	0	0	10	1	0
Roads Programme	6	1	1	18	5	2
Water Services Programme	3	1	0	0	0	0
Planning & Development	6	0	0	0	0	0
Environmental Services Programme	7	1	0	0	0	1
Recreation & Amenity	4	0	0	0	0	0
Agriculture, Education, Health & Welfare	3	0	0	0	0	0
Miscellaneous Services	4	1	0	0	0	0
Total:	40	4	1	28	6	4

A: €0.5-€5m, B: €5m-€20m, C: > €20m

Table 3: No of Expenditure Projects "Recently Completed" by Category

Service /Division	Current Expenditure			Capital Expenditure		
	A	B	C	A	B	C
Housing Programme						
Roads Programme				2		
Water Services Programme						
Planning & Development						
Environmental Services Programme				1		
Recreation & Amenity						
Agriculture, Education, Health & Welfare						
Miscellaneous Services						
Total:				3		

A: €0.5-€5m, B: €5m-€20m, C: > €20m

1.5 Published Summary of Procurements

As part of the Quality Assurance process Galway County Council has published, summary information on the Council's website of all procurements in excess of €10m. Listed below is the link to this publication page and an illustration of its location.

Link to Procurement Publications:

Source: <http://www.galway.ie/en/services/more/publicspendingcode/>

3 Assessment of Compliance

1.6 Checklist Completion

The third step in the Quality Assurance process involves completing a set of checklists covering all expenditure. The high level checks in Step 3 of the QA process are based on self-assessments carried out within the relevant sections / departments of Galway County Council in respect of guidelines set out in the Public Spending Code.

There are seven checklists in total:

Checklist 1: General Obligations Not Specific to Individual Projects/Programmes

Checklist 2: Capital Projects or Capital Grant Schemes Being Considered

Checklist 3: Current Expenditure Being Considered

Checklist 4: Capital Expenditure Being Incurred

Checklist 5: Current Expenditure Being Incurred

Checklist 6: Capital Expenditure Completed

Checklist 7: Current Expenditure Completed

1.7 Procedure used

Checklist 1 - General obligations not specific to Individual Projects/Programmes:

The first checklist captures obligations / good practice that apply to the organisation as a whole. This was completed and verified by the Procurement Officer and Head of Finance.

Checklist 2-7 – Galway County Council, compiled the overall checklists for the organisation, based on individual checklists completed by the relevant sections / organisations within Galway County Council.

Each relevant section / organisation within Galway County Council was required to produce a checklist on the spend categories (i.e.: Considered/Incurred/Recently Ended) as identified in the Inventory list and applicable to them. Only one checklist per section per stage of expenditure (expenditure type) was required.

1.7.1 Checklist - Capital Expenditure

Relevant sections / Organisations were required to comply with either (i) or (ii) below:-

(i) If a section had only one project/Programme, then they were required to complete the correct checklist (based on relevant expenditure type) for that project/programme.

Or

(ii) If a section had a number of projects/programmes, then under the relevant expenditure type, they were required to complete a checklist based on one of the relevant projects/programmes or based on 10% of the total number of relevant projects/programmes applicable to them - (rounded up) - whichever was the greater.

The following capital projects/programmes were selected:-

1.8 Checklist Results

The full set of checklists for Galway County Council are set out in Table 4 (Appendix 2). In addition to the self-assessed scoring, the vast majority of answers are accompanied by explanatory comments. Each question in the checklist is judged by a scoring scale-

Score 1 = Scope for significant improvements

Score 2 = Compliant but with some improvement necessary

Score 3 = Broadly compliant

1.9 Main Issues Arising from Checklist Assessment

The completed check lists show the extent to which Galway County Council believes it complies with the Public Spending Code. Overall, the checklists show a good level of compliance with the Code although perhaps in a less formal manner than set out in the code.

Galway County Council's set of checklists takes an overview of expenditure covering the organisation as a whole. Individual checklists from relevant sections / Organisations within Galway County Council have informed the completion of the Councils checklists.

The following are the main issues arising from the relevant checklist:-

1.9.1 General Obligations

Checklist 1 – General Obligations: - demonstrates Galway County Councils commitment to adhering to the Public Spending Code and the desire for more formal / structured training in this area.

1.9.2 Expenditure being considered

Checklist 2 – Capital Expenditure: - The checklist for capital expenditure under consideration suggests good levels of compliance with the PSC in general with regard to areas such as appraisal, procurement and Organisation guidelines.

Checklist 3 - Current Expenditure: - No new current expenditure programmes were under consideration in 2018.

1.9.3 Expenditure being incurred

Checklist 4 – Capital Expenditure: - The checklist for capital expenditure under consideration suggests good levels of compliance with the PSC in general with regard to areas such as appraisal, procurement and Organisation guidelines for projects under the control of Galway County Council. There are numerous TII projects which the council has limited input and merely act as a conduit for processing contractual payments. Our function on these projects typically concerns land acquisition, works accommodation and arbitration/legal expenditure.

Checklist 5 – Current Expenditure: - Well defined process in place which ensures that services are delivered efficiently and within budget. It should be noted that 40 - 45% on average of a service is comprised of payroll costs which is subject to regular audit.

1.9.4 Expenditure that has recently ended

Checklist 6 – Capital Expenditure: - The Council recognises the need for post project reviews in a formal manner.

Checklist 7 Current Expenditure: - This checklist did not apply as we did not have any current expenditure recently ended.

1.10 In-Depth Checks

The following section details the in-depth checks which were carried out by Galway County Councils Internal Auditor as part of the Public Spending Code. Existing spot check processes in the Council were examined as part of the in-depth checks.

4 Internal Audit

1.11 Summary of the Internal Audit in-depth check carried out on the N6 Galway City Bypass Appraisal Stage

This project is included in the 2018 Public Spending Code Capital Inventory under the category of expenditure being incurred with an overall estimated project cost of €593,330,000. The total project expenditure showing on the Council's Milestone 4 Financial Management System at 11/03/2019 was € 14.2 m

The total 2018 capital inventory expenditure is showing as €990 million and the value of this project represents 75 % of the overall expenditure less projects previously Audited.

% Calculation for Audit sample - QA Report 2018	
Total Value of Projects	€990,084,362
Total Capital Projects	€877,969,163
Less Capital Projects already Audited in Previous years on current Inventory	€89,200,000
Capital Projects Value for AUDIT SAMPLE	€788,769,163
Total value of CAPITAL Projects Audited	€593,330,000
Relevant % (Cap Projects Audited / CAPITAL Projects Value)	75.22%

The following is a summary of the findings of the in-depth check

1.12 Project Description

The project consists of the construction of 5.6km of single carriageway on the western side of the city and 11.9km dual carriageway on the eastern side of the city. It includes all associated link roads/side roads, structures, junctions and localised works to the existing electricity transmission and distribution network.

This project is part of the Galway Transport Strategy with the objective of developing a sustainable integrated transport solution to accommodate existing and future travel demands. The project is being undertaken by Galway County Council in conjunction with Galway City Council and Transport Infrastructure Ireland

Galway County Council assigned a Project Manager and appointed Consulting Engineers. There is a Steering Committee in place consisting of representatives from both Local Authorities and Transport Infrastructure Ireland who meet on a monthly basis with communication flows in compliance with the TII Project Management Guidelines.

1.13 Appraisal stage

A Project Brief was prepared in May 2014 with the Preliminary Appraisal Report issuing in October 2014. Following on from this a Route Selection Report issued in March 2016 and a publication consultation process took place.

A constraints study was then undertaken, and the design was completed in 2018. The Department of Transport approved the advancement of the project to An Bord Pleanála in October 2018.

The Environmental Impact Assessment report and the Natura Impact Statement were submitted to An Bord Pleanála with the decision pending at time of audit (11/03/2019). The project is now in the statutory process phase.

From the in-depth check carried out it is Internal Audits opinion that the appraisal stage of the project is in compliance with the public spending codes capital projects requirements.

1.14 Summary of In-Depth Check- Revenue Expenditure

As part of the 2018 Public Spending Code revenue inventory the Service Division D06 Community & Enterprise function was selected for the required in-depth check on revenue expenditure.

The selection of this service is in line with the Public Spending Code revenue in-depth check requirement as the service division expenditure increased more than €500,000 over the 2017 expenditure. This is in the main attributed to the delivery of a number of national funding programmes that are delivered by the Galway County Council through the Community & Enterprise Unit and a change in recoupment timeframes.

There is a total of 41 individual expenditure job codes under this service and Internal Audit examined a sample of codes to establish the expenditure incurred, reasons for the increase in expenditure, and the outputs and outcomes from the expenditure.

The findings are outlined below:

Job Code 04083064 Salaries Code-Community Enterprise/Economic Development, LCDC, LECP.

Actual expenditure showing in 2017-€16,932

Actual expenditure showing in 2018 – €136,686.51

Justification for the increase in expenditure:

The Local Government Reform Act 2014 provided for the establishment of the Local Community Development Committees in each Local Authority.

The increase in expenditure in 2018 is due to the Department of Rural & Community Development approval of 3 administration posts as additional resources to provide administrative support to the workings of the statutory Local Community Development Committee (LCDC). 2/3 of the midpoint of each salary scale is recoupable from Department of Rural & Community Development.

Salary recoupments in the amount of €103,389.41 were received.

Outputs

- Support to 6 LCDC meetings per annum and an additional 3 sub committees.
- Management and oversight of the Social Inclusion Community Activation Programme and preparation, implementing/monitoring of a 6-year Local Economic & Community Plan.
- Direct management of specific community funding schemes through publication, assessment/approval of funding and drawdown.

Outcomes

- Improved community amenities and facilities, health & wellbeing.
- Better use of resources across agencies by matching resource priorities.
- Galway County Council is better resourced to deliver on strategy provisions and community supports
- There is stronger governance of local community development spend and improved collaboration across a range of organisations and service delivery areas

Job Code 04050028- Strategy Implementation

Actual expenditure showing in 2017 -€25,341.21

Actual expenditure showing in 2018- €57,582

Justification of increase

The increase in expenditure is due to a number of new initiatives that came into operation in 2018 namely:

Rural Regeneration & Development Fund

Bia Innovator Food Hub

Cleaner Community Awards Schemes

The expenditure relates to the implementation of objectives and actions contained in the Local Economic Community Plan (LECP) and the costs incurred in the procurement of consultants for schemes/programmes that the Community, Enterprise & Economic Development Unit. Most of this increased expenditure was as a result of outsourcing small pieces of work in relation to the preparation of submissions for the 2018 Rural Regeneration and Development Fund (RRDF) 2018 in addition to contributions to one off initiatives. The cost of this came to approx. €41,000 which was shared with another job code.

Outputs

- Administrative support, site visits, facilitation of and attendance at workshops, meetings & events.
- Procurement of works for external support on a number of submissions relating to the above initiatives.

Outcomes

- Significant submissions for funding made to the Department of Rural & Community Development by Galway County Council in partnership with other entities and Local Communities.
- More community involvement that complemented the works of Tidy Towns Committee's.

Job code 04082020- Travel Expenses

Actual expenditure in 2017 -€23,636.21

Actual expenditure in 2018 €42,005.68

Justification for the increase

The increase in expenditure was due to activity in new areas of work and additional staff were assigned with salaries part funded by the Department of Rural & Community Development.

Increased activity in new areas of work namely:

Designated Rural & Economic Development Zones (REDZ)

Town & Village renewal schemes

Bank of Ireland National Enterprise Awards

Cleaner Community competition

Rural Regeneration & Development Fund initiative

European Region of Gastronomy Designation

Outputs

- Staff made site visits to various locations to meet community groups, and give advice and administrative support to workshops, events and meetings.
- Development work was carried out in relation to putting funding applications together and building collaborative relationships for funding programmes in the delivery of key actions contained in the Local Economic Community Plan and supporting the development of community capacity.
- The designation of Galway as the 2018 European Region of Gastronomy necessitated significant attendance and participation at a wide range of meetings, events, festivals and official engagements

- It is the opinion of senior management in the Community Enterprise & Economic Development Unit that having a Local Authority presence at various events and meetings ensures compliance, transparency and visibility.

Outcomes

- Staff supported community and voluntary groups with 30 food/ tourism events that occurred as a result of Galway County Council's European Region of Gastronomy Designation.
- Staff were involved in the coordination and support of 12 bigger type events that occurred as a result in the increase of programme activity.
- Significant funding was secured for the following through competitive funding calls:
- Rural Regeneration and Development Fund (RRDF) 2018
- Town & Village Renewal Scheme 2018
- Community Enhancement Scheme 2018
- The development of a pipeline of potential projects under the various schemes and delivery of actions contained in the Local Economic Community Plan and service delivery of the Community & Enterprise Unit
- Attendance at events are approved in advance by Line Leaders and business absences recorded and approved on the Core Time & Attendance system.

<p>Job code 04083058- Syrian Refugee Resettlement Programme.</p>

Actual expenditure in 2017 -the 2017 costs incurred were recouped and the code was reconciled showing a zero balance.

Actual expenditure in 2018- €132,220.69 with a figure of €53,818.70 recouped at April 2019

Justification for the increase in expenditure

The Resettlement Programme was approved in 2016 and families arrived in late 2016 with no funding agreement in place at that time. The Department of Justice subsequently provided funding for the Resettlement Programme. An Interagency Committee was set up to coordinate the services required which was supported by a grade 7 Administration Officer in the Community, Enterprise & Economic Development Unit of Galway County Council.

The costs also include the employment of 3 full time support workers on contracts for various periods during 2018.

Other expenditure incurred related to costs for resettlement families' health issues, education, transport and translation services.

Part of the 2018 expenditure has been recouped and it is Internal Audits understanding that there is a meeting pending with the Department of Justice to agree the final funding claim that is to be submitted.

Outputs

- Support services to the Interagency Committee and sub committees.
- Facilitation of access to the required health, legal, educational, childcare, translation and transport services.

Outcomes

- 20 Syrian refreguee families were settled into communities in 6 areas of County Galway

Job code 04083059- European Region of Gastronomy

Actual expenditure showing in 2017 - €22,787

Actual expenditure showing in 2018 - €257,638.00

Income receipted to this programme code for 2018 was €132,591.71

Balance outstanding €125,046

Justification for the increase

Galway County Council is the lead partner for the European Region of Gastronomy 2018 designation working and its partners Galway City Council, Galway Mayo Institute of Technology, Teagasc and other lead partners and organisations /bodies across the public/private /community and educational sector.

The expenditure incurred is in relation to the delivery of the bid book and the employment of an officer to lead the designation programme and associated requirements to fulfill the agreed Bid Book.

Costs involved European Membership Fees, Design and print, Public relations & Social Media Services /Video Production and other administration & event related costs.

Some costs are apportioned between Galway County Council and Galway City Council, Galway /Mayo Institute of Technology, and Teagasc.

An examination of files found that appropriate procurement methods were used for the engagement of service suppliers and supply of goods.

Funding Arrangement

Galway County Council funded a lot of the core activity around the implementation of the programme from its economic development budget and shared agreed costs of other aspects of the programme with the lead partners as follows:

Galway County Council 35%

Galway City Council-35%

Teagasc and GMIT funding 15% each.

Some payments remain outstanding at time of audit.

Outputs:

- Management have confirmed that expenditure in this area was particularly related to the year of designation
- However, as the programme supports key economic and community development in sectors such as tourism, agriculture, food, marine as well as social inclusion and community development the work carried out will assist Galway County Council to build on the activity in these key areas.
- Budget management and progress /activity reporting to the International Institute of Gastronomy, Culture, Arts, Tourism.
- Marketing, organization and operational management of the programme of events.

Outcomes:

- A number of new festivals and events developed, increasing greater economic activity and strengthening of local / rural economies.
- The development of a number of new initiatives and increased collaboration amongst partners i.e. Healthy Ireland Initiative and major capital investment for the Bia Innovator Hub
- Improved profile and reputation for the Galway food sector showcasing it at local, national, and international levels.

- Over €4m Public Relation value for Galway Food Promotion including a number of TV features.
- Bid Book delivered 6 months ahead of schedule in the year of designation.
- Designation in Galway for 2018 now a case-study for other countries as ‘Best in Class’.
- Third Place Finalist in Foodie Destinations 2018 awarded by the Restaurants Association of Ireland.
- Won Top Economic Development Project at the Excellence in Local Government Awards.
- Nominated as one of the Top 5 Large experiences along the Wild Atlantic Way.
- Dine in Galway branding, social media and events delivered with over 75 restaurants taking part.

<p>Job code 04081007- Social Inclusion Salaries</p>
--

Actual expenditure showing in 2017 - €127,046

Actual expenditure showing in 2018 - €198,347.55

Justification for the increase

The 2017 figure for social inclusion salaries expenditure code was down as a result of a Grade V Administration post being vacant for 9 months which was filled in 2018 resulting in an expenditure increase in that year.

There is a recoupment of salaries figure showing on the 2017 social inclusion salaries code but due to a change in the timeframe for recoupments the 2018 recoupment entitlement of 50% of a Grade V & Grade V1 salary can't be claimed until mid-2019.

Outputs

- Social inclusion support work is broad ranging in terms of facilitation and coordination of events for groups that have social inclusion elements namely Comhairle na Nog and the Galway Age friendly Programme, Galway Traveller Interagency Group.

Outcomes

- 2018 Bealtaine Festival event
- 2018 Social Inclusion Week event

- Age friendly in the public realm training event
- Healthy Ireland launch event
- Secured €100,000 to fund the Healthy Ireland programme
- Provided small grants to community groups to carry out social inclusion activities
- Hosted the Comhairle na Nog annual general meeting and coordinated the Comhairle na Nog Adult Steering Committee.

Internal audit comments:

The practice of spreading programme expenditure across a number of expenditure codes made it difficult to establish an audit trail and the exact expenditure incurred. However due to the nature of the work and interaction of programmes Internal Audit accepts there is a need for some expenditure to span a number of expenditure codes.

Expenditure codes are reviewed on a regular basis to ensure budget compliance and Internal Audit were informed that it is sometimes necessary to move expenditure between codes which is done by means of general ledger transfers.

A general level of observation in relation to monitoring of recoupment of eligible expenditure is maintained by management staff but a stronger monitoring control should to be put in place.

The unit has a significant number of officers at senior level whose focus has to be delivering programmes and services and it is Internal Audits opinion that it would be beneficial if there was a restructuring within the unit that would provide a better balance between staff working on delivering programmes and staff providing administrative/clerical support.

There are currently 41 expenditure/income codes in use.

Recommendations

The checks and controls to monitor income and expenditure need attention and would benefit from more clerical/admin support.

There are 41 expenditure codes in operation and some programme expenditure is interlinked and unavoidably crosses over a number of codes making it difficult to establish exact expenditure on specific items. In the interest of accountability there needs to be clear rationale in deciding on where to code expenditure. It would be beneficial to carry out a restructuring of the current coding system

Any outstanding recoupment claims/payments due to be followed up on.

Management Comment

It is accepted that income and expenditure code reconciliation is a priority for due diligence and compliance notwithstanding the increased level of activity within the area of Community, Rural & Economic Development and staff replacements pending. The multidimensional aspects and crossover of programme activity does not easily lend itself to expenditure code alignment throughout the year. It is taken that good practice in relation to procurement and necessary transfers between expenditure codes proves that the Community and Enterprise Unit are satisfactorily managing their budgets.

Next Steps: Addressing Quality Assurance Issues

The compilation of both the inventory and checklists for 2018 which is the fifth year of this QA process was a significant co-ordination task in terms of liaising with all relevant sections / Organisations within Galway County Council and collating of relevant information for the inventories and the checklists.

It is envisaged that with further training, the administrative burden of the QA process will ease over time. The process will continue to be embedded in how the Council conducts its business.

In addition, completed Value for Money and Policy Reviews (VFMs) and Focused Policy Assessments (FPAs) will assist in the QA process by highlighting the types of expenditure areas which merit in-depth checks. A summary of the proposed future process for in-depth checks by the Council is set out below.

1.14.1 Summary of Future Process for In-Depth check by Galway County Council

1. Inventory Compiled/Updated by Procurement Officer
2. In depth Check on small number of projects by Internal Auditor. The value of the projects selected for in depth review each year must follow the following:
 - a) For **CAPITAL** projects: projects selected must represent a min of 5% of the total value of all Capital projects on the Project Inventory
 - b) For **REVENUE** projects: projects selected must represent a min of 1% of the total value of all Revenue projects on the Project Inventory
 - c) These minima are averages over a three year period
 - d) The same projects should not be selected more than once in a three year period unless it is a follow up to a serious deficiency discovered previously.
 - e) Over a 3-5 year period all stages of the project life cycle & every scale of project should have been included in the in-depth check.
3. Internal Auditor Informs Relevant Section / Department of Selection.
4. Relevant Section / Department Provides Internal Auditor with All Relevant Material.
5. Internal Auditor Completes In-Depth Check to Assess Compliance with PSC.

1.15 Recommendations for future year QA reports

***Ongoing-Training:** ensure that relevant staff are updated on current information when issued on the PSC and implement training throughout the organisation as necessary. Training to occur for both the PSC QA Report team & also the senior staff within each Division.

***Procurement Unit:** GCC intend to continue to ensure that the Councils procurement practices align with the Public Spending Code where applicable. At the time of writing the procurement officer post is vacant and in the process of being filled.

***Job Code Review:** there is a need for a continuous review of how expenditure is coded so that it aligns more with PSC requirements. Note that a review of the “Job setup forms” occurred which should ensure better Job description.

***Post Project Review:** This is an area in which we are compliant. The need to improve is acknowledged for non TII / Large Departmental projects & this is an ongoing process. Staff will continue to be informed.

*** Making QA Checklists Live:** Continue to encourage Project leaders to use checklists per project consistently.

5 Conclusion

The inventory outlined in this report clearly lists the current and capital expenditure that is being considered, being incurred, and that has recently ended. The Council complies with all requirements of publishing procurements in excess of €10 million on its website. In this reporting period there are no procurements in excess of €10 million.

The checklists completed by the Council and its agencies show a high level of compliance with the Public Spending Code. The in-depth checks carried out on a selection of programmes revealed no major issues which would cast doubt on the Councils compliance with the Code.

However, it is acknowledged that continual additional work is required in order to ensure there is full information and understanding of the Public Spending Code and with appropriate training to ensure its full implementation and a structural approach to the Quality Assurance process.

Appendix 1A - Summary Inventory of Projects and Programmes > €0.5m

		CHK 2			CHK 4			CHK 6		
Capital Expenditure		Expenditure Being Considered			Expenditure Being Incurred			Expenditure Recently Ended		
		Projects	Value	%	Projects	Value	%	Projects	Value	%
A	Housing & Building	9	33,322,563	47%	11	25,358,950	3%	0	-	0%
B	Road Transportation and Safety	3	37,062,500	53%	25	723,233,240	90%	2	1,617,280	41%
C	Water Services	0	-	0%	0	-	0%	0	-	0%
D	Development Management	0	-	0%	0	-	0%	0	-	0%
E	Environmental Services	0	-	0%	1	55,000,000	7%	1	2,374,630	59%
F	Recreation and Amenity	0	-	0%	0	-	0%	0	-	0%
G	Agriculture, Education, Health, Welfare	0	-	0%	0	-	0%	0	-	0%
I	Miscellaneous Services	0	-	0%	0	-	0%	0	-	0%
Total:		12	70,385,063	100%	37	803,592,190	100%	3	3,991,910	100%
		-			-			-		
		CHK3			CHK 5			CHK 7		
Revenue/Current Expenditure		Expenditure Being Considered			Expenditure Being Incurred			Expenditure Recently Ended		
		Projects	Value	%	Projects	Value	%	Projects	Value	%
A	Housing & Building	0	€0		7	12,323,260	11%	0	€0.00	
B	Road Transportation and Safety	0	€0		8	40,689,678	36%	0	€0.00	
C	Water Services	0	€0		4	12,934,025	12%	0	€0.00	
D	Development Management	0	€0		6	8,150,750	7%	0	€0.00	
E	Environmental Services	0	€0		8	16,242,227	14%	0	€0.00	
F	Recreation and Amenity	0	€0		4	7,629,791	7%	0	€0.00	
G	Agriculture, Education, Health, Welfare	0	€0		3	2,360,089	2%	0	€0.00	
I	Miscellaneous Services	0	€0		5	11,785,380	11%	0	€0.00	
Total:		0	0	0%	45	112,115,200	100%	0	0	0%

% Calculation for Audit sample - QA Report 2018

Total Value of Projects	€990,084,362
Total Capital Projects	€877,969,163
Less Capital Projects already Audited in Previous years on current Inventory	€89,200,000
Capital Projects Value for AUDIT SAMPLE	€788,769,163
Total value of CAPITAL Projects Audited	€593,330,000
Relevant % (Cap Projects Audited / CAPITAL Projects Value)	75.22%

Appendix 1B - Full Inventory Listing

Local Authority	Expenditure		Being considered		Expenditure being incurred		Expenditure recently ended		NOTES
	Current	Capital Grant Schem es > €0.5m	Capital	Capital Projects	Capital Grants Schemes > €0.5m	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	Capital Grants Schemes	
	€0.5m	€0.5 - €5m	€5 - €20m	€20m plus	€0.5m	€0.5m			
Housing & Building	-	13,195,286	20,127,277	-	12,323,460	-	25,358,950	-	-
Housing & Building - number of projects	-	6	3	-	7	-	11	-	-
Weir Road			7,127,277						100% Funding
01021510 CAP - Eanach Mheain Voluntary Project CAS						1,780,569			100% Funding
01021708 CAP - Tirboy Tuam Refurb & Upgrade 14 Units						655,000			100% Funding
01017453 CAP-Remedial works Gilmartin Road						9,211,287			100% Funding
01020273 CAP-Construct Houses - Esker Fields & Garbally						1,980,000			100% Funding
01021505 CAP - Dunb Hill Voluntary Project CAS						2,793,453			100% Funding
01021504 CAP - Letterfrack Voluntary Project CAS						2,500,000			100% Funding
01021508 CAP - Mountbellow Voluntary Project CAS						824,250			100% Funding
01021509 CAP - Claregalway Voluntary Project CAS						1,765,198			100% Funding
Rurals 2018		800,000							100% Funding
House Acquisitions 2018			7,000,000						100% Funding
01020324 CAP- Fairgreen Roundstone		2,400,000							100% Funding
01020335 CAP-St Josephs Clifden		4,700,000							100% Funding
01020336 CAP- Bridge Court Ahasragh		2,400,000							100% Funding
01020332 CAP - Claremount Oughtraud		1,900,000							100% Funding
01020344 CAP- Mountain view Moycullen 30 units			6,000,000						100% Funding
A01 Maintenance & Improvement of LA Housing Units					4,757,396				100% GCC Funding
A02 Housing Assessment, Allocation and Transfer					522,593				100% GCC Funding
A03 Housing Rent & Tenant Purchase Administration					773,259				100% GCC Funding
A05 Administration of Homeless Services					1,148,490				100% GCC Funding
A06 Support To Housing Capital & AffordableProg					1,006,688				100% GCC Funding
A07 RAS Programme					3,426,302				100% GCC Funding
A08 Housing Loans					688,532				100% GCC Funding
01030802 CAP - Housing Aid for Older People Grant						1,178,575			80% Dept Funding, 20% GCC
01021704CAP - Traveller Programme						2,014,403			100% Funding
01016526 CAP - CCTV@ Cullairbaun, Bridget CT & Gort CAP - Culleen Carraree		995,286				656,215			100% Funding
Road Transportation and Safety	-	2,862,500	-	34,200,000	40,689,678	-	723,233,240	-	1,617,280
Road Transportation and Safety - number of projects	-	2	-	1	8	-	25	-	2
N59 Bunnakil to Claremount			34,200,000						100% Funding
SIG-Deratha Road		500,000							100% Funding
SIG- R332 Kibannon, Tuam		2,362,500							100% Funding
O2022401 N59 Moycullen Bypass 07/277							39,703,854		100% Funding

Local Authority	Expenditure		Being considered		Expenditure being incurred > €3.5m			Expenditure recently ended > €0.5m		NOTES
	Current > €0.5m	Capital Grant Schemes > €0.5m	Capital Projects €0.5 - €5m	Capital Projects €5 - €20m	Capital Projects €20m plus	Current Expenditure	Capital Grants	Capital Projects	Capital Grants Schemes	
Galway County Council										
02022404 N59 Clifden to Oughterard 09/4741							3,660,000			100% Funding
02221542 CAP N59 Maam Cross to Bunakill							11,190,000			100% Funding
02022433 N84 Luimnagh Realignment Scheme 11/7878 2										100% Funding
02022730 CAP - Galway City Bypass							593,330,000			100% Funding
02022731 CAP - N63 Abbeyknockmoy to Annagh Hill							13,028,783			100% Funding
04086115 CAP - Connemara Interpretation/Infrastructure							2,050,000			100% Funding
07014115 CAP - Dunkellin River & Agard Stream Flow							3,500,000			100% Funding
07014120 CAP - South Galway /Gort Lowlands flood relief Scheme							3,500,000			100% Funding
02221535 CAP -N67 Ballinderrreen to Kinvara Ph.2-GC							7,700,000			100% Funding
02221545 CAP - N65 Portumna HD28 Pavement contract overlay							654,017			100% Funding
02221550 CAP-Bunnacoonneen pavement overlay							1,515,800			100% Funding
02221551 CAP-N67 Kinvara pavement strengthening							848,056			100% Funding
02221553 CAP- N17 Tuam Town							1,016,576			100% Funding
02221554 CAP -N60 Ballymoe north pavement overlay							1,400,000			100% Funding
pavement strengthening							500,000			100% Funding
pavement strengthening							727,520			100% Funding
02221560 CAP- N84 Coarsefield pavement strengthening									831,744	100% Funding
pavement strengthening							582,016			100% Funding
02221567 CAP N59 Recess									785,536	100% Funding
02022777 CAP old N66 Kildreest							4,300,000			100% Funding
02293290 CAP N17 Milltown to Gortnagunnad realignment							1,000,000			100% Funding
02293291 CAP N59 West of Letterfrack widening							7,500,000			100% Funding
02293292 CAP N63 Ussto Abbeyknockmoy realignment roundabout							1,600,000			100% Funding
02221548 CAP N65 Kilmeen pavement strengthening Phase 2							10,400,000			100% Funding
02022433 N84 Luimnagh Realignment Scheme 11/7878 2							644,706			100% Funding
B01 NP Road - Maintenance and Improvement							1,400,000			100% Funding
B02 NS Road - Maintenance and Improvement							11,481,912			100% Funding
B03 Regional Road - Maintenance and Improvement							908,761			100% Funding
B04 Local Road - Maintenance and Improvement							3,564,186			100% Funding
B05 Public Lighting							8,392,006			100% Funding
B09 Maintenance & Management Car Parking							24,284,390			100% Funding
B10 Support to Roads Capital Prog							1,469,710			100% GCC Funding
B11 Agency & Recoupable Services							852,221			100% GCC Funding
							717,976			100% GCC Funding
							500,429			100% GCC Funding

Local Authority	Expenditure		Being considered		Expenditure being incurred		Expenditure recently ended			NOTES
	Current	> €0.5m	Capital	Capital Projects	Capital Grants Schemes	Capital Projects	Current Expenditure	Capital Grant Schemes	Capital Projects	
Galway County Council			€0.5 - €5m	€5 - €20m	€20m plus					
GO4 Veterinary Service						630,842				100% GCC Funding
Miscellaneous Services						11,785,380				
Miscellaneous Services - number of projects						5				
H01 Profit & Loss Machinery Account						1,231,127				100% GCC Funding
H03 Administration of Rates						5,033,205				100% GCC Funding
H09 Local Representation & Civic Leadership						1,334,874				100% GCC Funding
H10 Motor Taxation						1,595,149				100% GCC Funding
H11 Agency & Recoupable Services						2,591,025				100% GCC Funding
GRAND TOTALS €			16,057,786	20,127,277	34,200,000	112,115,200		808,592,190		3,991,910
GRAND TOTALS - Numbers of Projects			8	3	1	45		37		3

Appendix 2 - Reports Arising from In-Depth Checks- Checklists 1-7

Appendix 2 - Reports Arising from In-Depth Checks- Checklists 1-7

Checklist 1:

Galway County Council's Compiled Set of Checklists

Based on responses to the samples taken:

General Obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes

General Obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Discussion/Action Required
1.1 Does the organisation ensure, on an ongoing basis, that appropriate people within the organisation and its agencies are aware of their requirements of the Public Spending Code (incl. through training)?	2	2018 is the fifth year of the PSC in Local Government. Senior Staff have been briefed on their obligations
1.2 Has training on the Public Spending Code been provided to relevant staff within the organisation?	2	Briefings /Training were provided in 2018 to the relevant staff.
1.3 Has the Public Spending Code been adapted for the type of project/programme that your organisation is responsible for? i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed?	3	2018 is fifth year of PSC and while the revised National QA Guidance is being complied with, The latest Guidance was issued for the sector in Feb 2017.

<p>1.4 Has the organisation in its role as Sanctioning Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the Public Spending Code?</p>	<p>N/A</p>	<p>No Projects relevant to the PSC currently</p>
<p>1.5 Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot checks) been disseminated, where appropriate, within the organisation and to agencies?</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>The recommendation to indicate a process of information and training throughout the organisation was carried out through an awareness briefing sessions over the past years which included the circulation of guidance notes plus a full suite of information / guidance placed on the intranet. Face to face meetings occurred with the relevant seniors in each section. Also, as previously advised in the past where our Internal Auditor has carried out spot checks (on services), reports and recommendations would have been sent to the relevant unit for review and application</p>
<p>1.6 Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon?</p>	<p>2</p>	<p>Yes, see above answer. Also, Internal Audit recommendations have been acted upon. Some improvement should be considered on the Capital coding structure.</p>
<p>1.7 Has an annual Public Spending Code QA report been certified by the organisation Chief Executive, submitted to NOAC and published on the organisation's website?</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>Yes. CE has signed off</p>
<p>1.8 Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP?</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>Required Sample reviewed</p>
<p>1.9 Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations/Post Project Reviews? Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>With large projects (e.g.: TII / other ROADS / Housing projects) Post project evaluations are integral).</p>

<p>emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability of the project.</p>		
<p>1.10 How many formal Post Project Review evaluations have been completed in the year under review? Have they been issued promptly to the relevant stakeholders / published in a timely manner?</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>Where required</p>
<p>1.11 Is there a process to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations/Post project reviews?</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>Yes</p>
<p>1.12 How have the recommendations of previous evaluations/post project reviews informed resource allocation decisions?</p>	<p>3</p>	<p>yes</p>

Checklist 2:

To be completed in respect of capital projects or capital programme / grant scheme that is or was under consideration in the past year.

Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
PROJECT/ PROG NAME: Is Funding > 50% Central Govt		
2.1 Was a preliminary appraisal undertaken for all projects > €5m?	3	Yes, both to GCC's internal standards + sanctioning body standards
2.2 Was an appropriate appraisal method used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes?	3	Yes, in co-ordination with sanctioning body standards
2.3 Was a CBA/CEA completed for all projects exceeding €20m?	3	Yes, in co-ordination with sanctioning body standards
2.4 Was the appraisal process commenced at an early stage to facilitate decision making? (i.e. prior to the decision)	3	Yes, as per sanctioning body funding requirements
2.5 Was an Approval in Principle granted by the Sanctioning Authority for all projects before they entered the planning and design phase (e.g. procurement)?	3	Yes, as per sanctioning body funding requirements
2.6 If a CBA/CEA was required was it submitted to the relevant Department for their views?	3	Carried out by other Bodies which then provide funding to GCC
2.7 Were the NDFA consulted for projects costing more than €20m?	3	Carried out by other Bodies which then provide funding to GCC

2.8 Were all projects that went forward for tender in line with the Approval in Principle and if not was the detailed appraisal revisited and a fresh Approval in Principle granted?	3	Yes
2.9 Was approval granted to proceed to tender?	3	Yes
2.10 Were procurement rules complied with?	3	Yes, full tender process complied with
2.11 Were State Aid rules checked for all supports?	3	Yes, we understand that his applies to grants which are subject to separate audit
2.12 Were the tenders received in line with the Approval in Principle in terms of cost and what is expected to be delivered?	3	Yes, full tender process complied with
2.13 Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	3	KPI's were set for each project
2.14 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	3	Yes, ongoing monitoring in place

Checklist 3:

New current expenditure or expansion of existing current expenditure under consideration

Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self-Assessed Compliance	Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
3.1 Were objectives clearly set out?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.2 Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.3 Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal, prepared for new current expenditure?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.4 Was an appropriate appraisal method used?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.5 Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.6 Did the business case include a section on piloting?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.7 Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018.
3.8 Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme?	N/A		No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018

3.9 Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Department?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.10 Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.11 Was the required approval granted?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.12 Has a sunset clause (as defined in section B06, 4.2 of the Public Spending Code) been set?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.13 If outsourcing was involved were procurement rules complied with?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.14 Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
3.15 Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018

Checklist 4:

Complete if your organisation had capital projects/programmes that were incurring expenditure during the year under review.

Incurring Capital Expenditure PROJECT/ PROG NAME: Central Govt	Is Funding > 50%	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
4.1 Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval in Principle?		3	Contracts were awarded and signed following procurement tender competitions
4.2 Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?		3	Yes, GCC has specific design & implementation sections for all major funding streams (Roads, Housing, and flood mgmt.). In the case of TII projects formal Steering Committees are in place
4.3 Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?		3	Formal programme co-ordinators are appointed
4.4 Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project?		3	Formal project managers are appointed
4.5 Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?		3	Progress reports reviewed at regular Management Team Meetings – Monthly meetings of the Steering Committee include progress reports.

4.6 Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule?	3	Yes
4.7 Did budgets have to be adjusted?	3	Yes – with consent of relevant body (TII)
4.8 Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly?	3	Yes
4.9 Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case incl. CBA/CEA? (Exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.)	Yes	Economic & Environmental conditions dictated/changed progression.
4.10 If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/programme/grant scheme was the project subjected to adequate examination?	3	Re-appraisals were carried out
4.11 If costs increased was approval received from the Sanctioning Authority?	3	Yes – with consent of relevant body (TII)
4.12 Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?	3	Some projects were postponed or curtailed

Checklist 5:

Incurring Current Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 -3	Comment/Action Required
5.1 Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?	3	Yes, as per Budget Report and Annual Business Plan.
5.2 Are outputs well defined?	3	National KPI's are in place for Galway County Council
5.3 Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?	3	Yes
5.4 Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an ongoing basis?	3	Yes, based on regular reviews of business plan, financial reporting, and SMT Meetings. FMS reviews on budgets v's actual
5.5 Are outcomes well defined?	3	Outcomes are considered as part of the business plan objectives
5.6 Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?	3	Outcomes are directly measured & correlated back to expenditure/inputs
5.7 Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?	3	LGMA performance Management Indicators (eRtns)
5.8 Are other data compiled to monitor performance?	3	Presented at Management Team Meetings periodically
5.9 Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an ongoing basis?	3	Yes, based on regular reviews of business plan, financial reporting, and SMT Meetings

5.10 Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' 1 of programmes/projects?	3	Yes, in particular the LGMA evaluates via BPI models
--	---	--

For current expenditure being incurred

Checklist 6:

To be completed if capital projects (Ended) – were completed during the year or if capital programmes/grant schemes matured or were discontinued.

Capital Expenditure Recently Completed	PROJECT/ PROG NAME:	Is Funding > 50% Central Govt	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
6.1	How many post project reviews were completed in the year under review?		1	Carried out where specifically required by funding bodies
6.2	Was a post project review completed for all projects/programmes exceeding €20m?		N/A	
6.3	Was a post project review completed for all capital grant schemes where the scheme both (1) had an annual value in excess of €30m and (2) where scheme duration was five years or more?		N/A	
6.4	Aside from projects over €20m and grant schemes over €30m, was the requirement to review 5% (Value) of all other projects adhered to?		3	Yes
6.5	If sufficient time has not elapsed to allow for a proper assessment, has a post project review been scheduled for a future date?		N/A	
6.6	Were lessons learned from post-project reviews disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and to the Sanctioning Authority? (Or other relevant bodies)		2	Carried out where specifically required by funding bodies
6.7	Were changes made to practices in light of lessons learned from post-project reviews?		2	Carried out where specifically required by funding bodies

6.8 Were project reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	2	May be carried out by independent consultants in the case of large Engineering projects
---	---	---

Checklist 7

To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued.

Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
7.1 Were reviews carried out of current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
7.2 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
7.3 Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
7.4 Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018

7.5 Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
7.6 Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018
7.7 Were changes made to the organisation's practices in light of lessons learned from reviews?	N/A	No programmes relevant to PSC in 2018

Appendix 3 – Internal Audit In-depth Checks

Quality Assurance In Depth Check- N6 Galway City Bypass - Appraisal Stage

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the project in question which relates to the Appraisal Stage of the N6 Galway City Bypass

Project Information	
Name	N6 Galway City Bypass
Detail	Construction of 5.6 km single carriageway on the western side of the city and the construction of 11.9 km of dual carriageway on the eastern side of the city and associated link roads/side roads, structures, junctions and localised works to the existing electricity transmission & distribution network
Responsible Body	Transport Infrastructure Ireland/ Galway County Council /Galway City Council
Current Status	Pending approval from An Bord Pleanala to proceed to the construction stage

Start Date	2013
End Date	On Going
Overall Cost	Estimated cost of €593,330,000 Expenditure as at 31/12/2018 was €14,217,508

Project Description:

Construction of 5.6 km single carriageway on the western side of the city and the construction of 11.9 km of dual carriageway on the eastern side of the city and associated link roads/side roads, structures, junctions and localised works to the existing electricity transmission & distribution network. The footprint for the proposed road will be approximately 280 hectares .

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, internal audit has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the appraisal stage of the N6 Galway City Bypass

Objectives: Galway County Council are working in conjunction with Galway City Council and Transport Infrastructure Ireland to develop a sustainable integrated transport solution that will accommodate existing and future travel demands. The project forms part of the Galway Transport Strategy.

Inputs: Engagement of Consultants by open competition along with all associated costs, time and works carried out in the culmination in the production and publication of an the Environmental Impact Assessment Report .

The Environmental Impact Assessment Report is inclusive of planning and policy issues, justification of need for the project, project constraints, alternatives considered, route selection, traffic assessments, construction activities and environmental commitments. A Cost Benefit Analysis was prepared as part of the financial appraisal which can be seen on appendix 6.2 of this report. The expenditure as at 31/12/2018 was €14,217,508.00

Activities Traffic & environmental surveys, preparation of various reports, public consultation process, scheme design, Planning & CPO preparation & publication

Outputs: Lodgement of planning application with an Bord Pleanala for approval to construct the ring road and associated works

Outcomes: Transport infrastructure which will improve traffic flow, connectivity and accessibility to and through Galway City

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the N6 Galway City Bypass project from intervention stage to current position in terms of major project milestones

May 2014-Project Brief completed and issued

October 2014- Preliminary Appraisal Report issued

March 2016-Route Selection Report issued

Public Consultation Process took place

Constraints Study undertaken

June 2018-Design completed

October 2018- Department of Transport approved the advancement of the project to An Bord Pleanala

October 2018-Environmental Impact Assessment Report and the Natura Impact Statement were submitted to An Bord Pleanala with the project now in the statutory process phase

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal of the project.

Project/Programme Key Documents	
Title	Details
Project Brief/Preliminary Appraisal report	A project brief was prepared to outline the objectives of the project and its intended outputs inclusive of scheme concept and feasibility studies
Route Selection Report	The route selection report considered all the options with respect to the various surveys undertaken and cost benefit analysis/safety/environmental appraisal and compatibility with planning policy of each option. Part of the preferred route is a motorway and another part is a protected road.
Project appraisal of route options	This resulted in the recommendation of the preferred route corridor
Design – Cost Benefit Analysis Report	This is detailed in appendix A.6.2 of the Environmental Impact Assessment Report
Environmental Impact Assessment Report	This report includes all aspects of the project – planning policy, project need & description, traffic assessments, alternative routes considered, construction activities, various environmental assessment reports & commitments, safety aspects
Department of Transport letter of approval	The Department of Transport approved the business case for the project for submission to An Bord Pleanála for advancement through the statutory development consent process

<p>Submission of Documentation to an Bord Pleanala</p>	<p>The Environmental Impact Assessment report and the Natura Impact Statement were submitted to an Bord Pleanala on 23/10/2018</p> <p>The Motorway & Protected Road schemes were submitted on 26/10/2018</p>
<p>TII Project Management Guidelines – PE-PMG-02041 September 2017</p>	<p>Sets out the Roles & Responsibilities and Engagement & Communication framework for the project.</p>

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the appraisal stage of the project
 It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Project Brief	Outlines the need and objective of the project	Yes
Preliminary Appraisal Report	Project Appraisal	Yes
Design- Cost Benefit Analysis Report	Financial Appraisal	Yes
Environmental Impact Assessment Report	Appraisal & Approval	Yes
TII Project Management Guidelines - September 2017.	Compliance	Yes

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the N6 Galway City Bypass

Does the delivery of the project comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage)

Yes.

The project was adequately appraised with risks and constraints identified in the Environmental Impact Assessment Report

All the required reports and analysis were seen and were in compliance with the various statutory codes.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

Yes. The data is available from Galway County Council, National Roads Project Office.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

No Recommendation

Summary of the Internal Audit in-depth check carried out on the N6 Galway City Bypass Appraisal Stage

This project is included in the 2018 Public Spending Code Capital Inventory under the category of expenditure being incurred with an overall estimated project cost of €593,330,000. The total project expenditure showing on the Council's Milestone 4 Financial Management System at 11/03/2019 was € 14.2 m

The following is a summary of the findings of the in-depth check

Project Description

The project consists of the construction of 5.6km of single carriageway on the western side of the city and 11.9km dual carriageway on the eastern side of the city. It includes all associated link roads/side roads, structures, junctions and localised works to the existing electricity transmission and distribution network.

This project is part of the Galway Transport Strategy with the objective of developing a sustainable integrated transport solution to accommodate existing and future travel demands. The project is being undertaken by Galway County Council in conjunction with Galway City Council and Transport Infrastructure Ireland

Galway County Council assigned a Project Manager and appointed Consulting Engineers. There is a Steering Committee in place consisting of representatives from both Local Authorities and Transport Infrastructure Ireland who meet on a monthly basis with communication flows in compliance with the TII Project Management Guidelines.

Appraisal stage

A Project Brief was prepared in May 2014 with the Preliminary Appraisal Report issuing in October 2014. Following on from this a Route Selection Report issued in March 2016 and a publication consultation process took place.

A constraints study was then undertaken, and the design was completed in 2018. The Department of Transport approved the advancement of the project to an Bord Pleanála in October 2018.